#### Message

From: Suarez, Mark [Suarez.Mark@epa.gov]

**Sent**: 1/11/2021 3:35:09 PM

To: Berwald, Derek [Berwald.Derek@epa.gov]; Wyatt, TJ [Wyatt.Tj@epa.gov]; Johnson, Hope [Johnson.Hope@epa.gov];

Kaul, Monisha [Kaul.Monisha@epa.gov]; Hendrick, Lindsey [hendrick.lindsey@epa.gov]; Waterworth, Rebeccah

[Waterworth.Rebeccah@epa.gov]; Hansel, Jeana [Hansel.Jeana@epa.gov]; Santiago, Sergio

[Santiago.Sergio@epa.gov]

CC: Rate, Debra [Rate.Debra@epa.gov]

Subject: Re: Aldicarb - Response to Comments - Request for Team Expertise and input 12:00pm Monday (1/11/21)

Derek,

I was thinking

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

# Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Regards, Mark

Mark Suarez Senior Scientist Science Information & Analysis Branch Biological and Economic Analysis Division Office of Pesticide Programs U.S. EPA

From: Berwald, Derek <Berwald.Derek@epa.gov>

**Sent:** Monday, January 11, 2021 9:49 AM

**To:** Suarez, Mark <Suarez.Mark@epa.gov>; Wyatt, TJ <Wyatt.Tj@epa.gov>; Johnson, Hope <Johnson.Hope@epa.gov>; Kaul, Monisha <Kaul.Monisha@epa.gov>; Hendrick, Lindsey <hendrick.lindsey@epa.gov>; Waterworth, Rebeccah <Waterworth.Rebeccah@epa.gov>; Hansel, Jeana <Hansel.Jeana@epa.gov>; Santiago, Sergio

<Santiago.Sergio@epa.gov>

Cc: Rate, Debra < Rate. Debra@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: Aldicarb - Response to Comments - Request for Team Expertise and input 12:00pm Monday (1/11/21)

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

However, I think

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

### Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

db

From: Suarez, Mark <Suarez.Mark@epa.gov> Sent: Monday, January 11, 2021 9:20 AM

To: Wyatt, TJ <Wyatt.Tj@epa.gov>; Johnson, Hope <Johnson.Hope@epa.gov>; Berwald, Derek

<Berwald.Derek@epa.gov>; Kaul, Monisha <Kaul.Monisha@epa.gov>; Hendrick, Lindsey <hendrick.lindsey@epa.gov>;

Waterworth, Rebeccah < Waterworth.Rebeccah@epa.gov>; Hansel, Jeana < Hansel.Jeana@epa.gov>; Santiago, Sergio

<Santiago.Sergio@epa.gov> Cc: Rate, Debra < Rate. Debra@epa.gov> Subject: RE: Aldicarb - Response to Comments - Request for Team Expertise and input 12:00pm Monday (1/11/21) Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP) I looked at the dicamba opinion cited to Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP) Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP) But, I agree with Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP) Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP) l suggest i Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP) Mark From: Wyatt, TJ < Wyatt. Tj@epa.gov> **Sent:** Monday, January 11, 2021 8:57 AM To: Johnson, Hope < Johnson. Hope@epa.gov>; Berwald, Derek < Berwald. Derek@epa.gov>; Kaul, Monisha <Kaul. Monisha@epa.gov>; Hendrick, Lindsey <hendrick.lindsey@epa.gov>; Waterworth, Rebeccah

<Waterworth.Rebeccah@epa.gov>; Hansel, Jeana <Hansel.Jeana@epa.gov>; Suarez, Mark <Suarez.Mark@epa.gov>;

Santiago, Sergio <Santiago. Sergio@epa.gov> Cc: Rate, Debra < Rate. Debra@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: Aldicarb - Response to Comments - Request for Team Expertise and input 12:00pm Monday (1/11/21)

Hi. Debra sent me a link (thanks?).

When CBD refers to 'costs of registration,' they are thinking of Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP) Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

I think our response should be

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

From: Johnson, Hope < Johnson. Hope@epa.gov>

Sent: Monday, January 11, 2021 6:49 AM

To: Wyatt, TJ < Wyatt. Tj@epa.gov>; Berwald, Derek < Berwald. Derek@epa.gov>; Kaul, Monisha

<Kaul.Monisha@epa.gov>; Hendrick, Lindsey < hendrick.lindsey@epa.gov>; Waterworth, Rebeccah

<Waterworth.Rebeccah@epa.gov>; Hansel, Jeana <Hansel Jeana@epa.gov>; Suarez, Mark <Suarez Mark@epa.gov>;

Santiago, Sergio <Santiago.Sergio@epa.gov>

Subject: FW: Aldicarb - Response to Comments - Request for Team Expertise and input 12:00pm Monday (1/11/21)

Importance: High

See link below to folder that contains the current draft of the comment response. See Comment response to CBD #9. RD tags us to help revise/draft that response.

#### CBD Comment #9:

The EPA must analyze the true costs of registering new uses of aldicarb as outlined in the recent 9th Circuit Court of Appeals 2020 ruling on dicamba.

RD tags us to review CBD comment #2 as well, but I don't think there is anything for BEAD to respond to .

From: Rate, Debra < Rate. Debra@epa.gov > Sent: Sunday, January 10, 2021 3:39 PM

Hope < Johnson Hope@epa.gov>; Suarez, Mark < Suarez Mark@epa.gov>; Hendrick, Lindsey

<a href="mailto:hendrick.lindsey@epa.gov">hendrick.lindsey@epa.gov</a>; Blankinship, Amy

<Blankinship.Amy@epa.gov>; Wente, Stephen < Wente.Stephen@epa.gov>; Wagman, Michael

<<u>Wagman.Michael@epa.gov</u>>; Lin, James <<u>lin.james@epa.gov</u>>; Johnson, Marion <<u>Johnson.Marion@epa.gov</u>>; Adeeb, Shanta <Adeeb.Shanta@epa.gov>

Cc: Echeverria, Marietta < <a href="mailto:Echeverria.Marietta@epa.gov">Echeverria.Marietta@epa.gov</a>; Matuszko, Jan < <a href="mailto:Matuszko.Jan@epa.gov">Matuszko.Jan@epa.gov</a>; Vogel, Dana@epa.gov</a>; Aubee, Catherine < <a href="mailto:Aubee.Catherine@epa.gov">Aubee, Catherine@epa.gov</a>; Rosenblatt, Daniel < <a href="mailto:Rosenblatt.Dan@epa.gov">Rosenblatt.Dan@epa.gov</a>>

**Subject:** Aldicarb - Response to Comments - Request for Team Expertise and input 12:00pm Monday (1/11/21)

Importance: High

Confidential, Internal and Deliberative Not for public disclosure.

Hi Team:

In order to keep the decision memo moving forward with review, we decided that the RTC will be a separate memo posted to the docket.

We drafted the RTC memo and have provided responses wherever possible (~80%), but we need team expertise and input as indicated in Comment Boxes throughout the document to get it to the finish line - by noon Monday in keeping with senior management directive.

The draft memo is located on the OneDrive in the 1-5-21 New Aldicarb Documents folder.

https://usepa-my.sharepoint.com/:f:/g/personal/rate\_debra\_epa\_gov/Eks8dWE0gGtCgLkPYEEmIFEB8Ouureitd2wmdSultZWUw?e=4rfrl2

Summary of Comments (43 unique):

The positive and negative comments were downloaded from FDMS and are on the OneDrive as well.

The positive comments are from grower groups, citrus owners, applicators, the USDA.

Most of the usual players have submitted comments against the approval:

Center for Biological Diversity (CBD)
Environmental Justice
Environmental Working Group
US Research group – mass signature campaign (Small comment – 7975 signatures)
Individuals and anonymous

Let us know if you have any questions.

Thank you.

Debra

Debra Rate, Ph.D. Senior Regulatory Specialist Invertebrate & Vertebrate Branch 2 Registration Division U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Phone: 703-306-0309